

# Indirect cultural investments in Saskatoon in 2016

*With comparisons to seven other Canadian municipalities*

Researched and prepared for...



By Kelly Hill



[www.HillStrategies.com](http://www.HillStrategies.com)

October 2017

## Contents

*Introduction and definitions 1*

*Summary of indirect cultural investments in Saskatoon 3*

*Inter-municipal comparisons of indirect cultural investments 5*

*Appendix: Details of indirect municipal cultural investments in eight participating municipalities 7*

## Introduction and definitions

Canadian municipalities support the arts, culture, and heritage in many ways, through both direct funding and indirect investments in services designed to help sustain and develop the local cultural sector. This report summarizes a recent research process into **indirect** cultural investments in eight Canadian municipalities:

- District of Sechelt
- Edmonton (led by the Edmonton Arts Council)
- Saskatoon
- London
- Brampton
- Mississauga
- Greater Sudbury
- Halifax Regional Municipality

While there have been recent attempts to identify and compare direct cultural investments at the municipal level<sup>1</sup>, very little research has been conducted into municipalities' indirect supports for the arts, culture, and heritage.

Recognizing this gap, Kevin Kitchen and Kathy Allen at the City of Saskatoon provided the impetus for this research project. After initial consultations with Hill Strategies, a call was put out for other municipal participants, resulting in the current consortium of eight municipalities. The municipalities range greatly in population size, from 10,200 residents in Sechelt, B.C. to over 930,000 residents in Edmonton.

The report is based on a survey of cultural staff members in the eight municipalities as well as discussions that helped ensure clarity and, wherever possible, consistency. Two conference calls were organized to discuss the details of the project and to ensure that participating municipalities had similar understandings of indirect cultural investments.

Hill Strategies thanks all the respondents (and their municipal colleagues) for their thoughtfulness and willing participation in a detailed and time-consuming process.

### What do we mean by “indirect cultural investments”?

Based on an initial group discussion as well as a previous Hill Strategies report on five large Canadian cities<sup>2</sup>, municipalities reported on the following 11 types of indirect cultural investments:

---

<sup>1</sup> See the work by [Municipal Benchmarking Network Canada](#) and two reports by Hill Strategies Research (on [five large cities](#) and [seven other Canadian cities](#)).

<sup>2</sup> Nine types of indirect supports were included in the report for five large cities. See <http://www.hillstrategies.com/content/indirect-cultural-investments-five-large-canadian-cities>

1. In-kind services for festivals, special events, film, etc. (e.g., permits, fire, police, EMS, waste management, transit, etc.)
2. Below-market or nominal rent in municipally-owned spaces for arts, culture, and heritage organizations
3. Property tax rebates / abatements / exemptions for arts, culture, and heritage organizations (whether through local decision-making or provincial statutes)
4. Line of credit / loan guarantees for arts, culture, and heritage organizations
5. Fund management / investments (e.g., endowments, trusts) on behalf of arts, culture, and heritage organizations
6. Community capacity building (e.g., board development, organizational development, workshops, seminars, meetings)
7. Free or below-market rates for arts, culture, and heritage organization advertising on city structures (e.g., bus shelters, buildings, etc.).
8. Formal arts, cultural, or heritage districts (approval, development, or planning)
9. Heritage conservation incentives (indirect / non-monetary)
10. Modified planning regulations to support cultural sector (with no direct financial implications)
11. Density bonusing (i.e., allowing higher building density in return for community cultural benefits)

The municipalities were also asked about a twelfth possible type of indirect cultural investment, but none of the participants have “community use agreements”, whereby private spaces (such as squares surrounding private businesses) could be used for public purposes (such as festivals), at a nominal rental rate.

The respondents were asked to report on their activities in these areas in 2016, but some municipalities provided certain indirect investments prior to 2016 (but had no examples from 2016 itself). These situations are included as a support from these municipalities but are noted in the report as not being provided in 2016.

There is no standard methodology for estimating the value of indirect cultural investments. This study uses municipal estimates of out-of-pocket expenses and foregone revenues as the best possible estimates. However, despite the best efforts of municipal staff members participating in this project, there are many data gaps – areas where the value of indirect financial cultural investments could only be approximated or could not be estimated at all. In addition, a few participating municipalities are part of two-tiered government structures, where another municipal level is responsible for certain services (typically fire, policing, roads, and other areas). Values of indirect investments for these other municipal levels are generally not included here, due to complications in data gathering.

In general, this report follows Statistics Canada’s definition of culture: “Creative artistic activity and the goods and services produced by it, and the preservation of heritage.”<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> *Conceptual Framework for Cultural Statistics*, 2011, <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/87-542-x/2011001/section/s3-eng.htm>

## Summary of indirect cultural investments in Saskatoon

The City of Saskatoon provides indirect supports in six of the 11 areas included in the study:

- In-kind services for festivals, special events, film, etc. (e.g., permits, fire, police, EMS, waste management, transit, etc.)
- Below-market or nominal rent in municipally-owned spaces for arts, culture, and heritage organizations
- Property tax rebates / abatements / exemptions for arts, culture, and heritage organizations
- Community capacity building (e.g., board development, organizational development, workshops, seminars, meetings)
- Heritage conservation incentives (indirect / non-monetary)
- Density bonusing (i.e., allowing higher building density in return for community cultural benefits)

The City was active in five of these areas in 2016, having had no recent examples of density bonusing in return for community cultural benefits.

Details about the City's supports in these areas follow. These supports are provided by many different municipal departments and agencies.

### In-kind services for festivals, special events, film, etc. (e.g., permits, fire, police, EMS, waste management, transit, etc.)

- Transit: road closures (barricades) and waste management (recycling and garbage receptacles); Parks does provide small turf repairs at no cost but does not track this - they do charge for large turf repairs. Working within the Organized Event Emergency Planning Bylaw, EMO is part of a coordinated approach to review and prepare for events being held in the City of Saskatoon and surrounding area. EMO's involvement starts with the Event Review Procedure (assessing all events) to determine risk posed by multiple events taking place at the same time as well as the individual event risk and plan for possible emergency response.
- 48 events were supported (Known costs include transit: \$94,694.52 + Police \$27,254.98 + Shakespeare Festival Site washrooms \$3,143.54; known total of \$125,093.04). EMO participated in 20 of these events; they do not have a dollar estimate of their contribution.

### Below-market or nominal rent in municipally-owned spaces for arts, culture, heritage organizations

- TCU Place provides discounted rental rates but does not have a formal policy on this matter; rates are negotiated during bookings; no other civic facilities provide discounts.
- \$19,500 in rental discounts for 17 different events (Saskatoon Symphony, dance organizations, choirs, etc.)

### Property tax rebates / abatements / exemptions for arts, culture, heritage organizations (whether through local decision-making or provincial statutes)

- Only arts/culture/heritage organizations in the Culture Grant Program are eligible for a tax abatement.
- 6 organizations (6 properties) received abatements totalling \$286,697.09. On a per-capita basis, this equals \$1.16.

### Community capacity building (e.g., board development, organizational development, workshops, seminars, meetings)

- Meet and greet/networking; Anti-racism workshop; CDM board workshop; public art workshop; total municipal cost of \$1264.28

### Heritage conservation incentives (indirect / non-monetary)

- \$7,500 towards a mural project that may include alternative solutions to address building code requirements, providing streetscaping elements which enhance the heritage structure, or a rezoning by agreement for adaptive reuse of the property.

### Density bonusing (i.e., allowing higher building density in return for community benefits)

- Density bonus for exceeding the maximum building height in the B6 (Downtown Commercial) Zoning District for the provision of public plazas, public art, and/or the conservation and incorporation of significant existing heritage or historical feature.
- No examples in 2016.

Excluding property tax abatements, the City of Saskatoon has identified approximately \$144,000 in indirect cultural investments (or \$0.58 per capita). With the \$1.16 per capita in property tax abatements, the value of indirect cultural investments in the five areas with at least a partial cost estimate is approximately \$1.74. It should be noted that a full cost estimate was not possible for some types of indirect cultural support. The overall estimate is therefore partial and not directly comparable to other municipalities participating in the research.

## Inter-municipal comparisons of indirect cultural investments

The appendix to this report provides a summary of all eight municipalities' responses to the 11 possible indirect supports.

A comparison of the responses shows that similar types of supports are provided in many municipalities. Four supports are provided by all eight municipalities:

- In-kind services for festivals, special events, film, etc. (e.g., permits, fire, police, EMS, waste management, transit, etc.)
- Below-market or nominal rent in municipally-owned spaces for arts, culture, heritage organizations
- Property tax rebates / abatements / exemptions for arts, culture, heritage organizations (whether through local decision-making or provincial statutes)
- Helping cultural organizations develop their capacity (by providing opportunities for board development, organizational development, workshops, seminars, meetings, etc.)

Seven of the eight municipalities award density bonusing (i.e., allow higher building density in return for community benefits).

Six municipalities provide free or below-market rates for arts, culture, heritage organization advertising on city structures (e.g., bus shelters, buildings, etc.).

Five are involved in the approval, development and/or planning of formal arts, cultural, or heritage districts, and the same number provide indirect (non-monetary) heritage conservation incentives.

The remaining supports are provided by four or fewer municipalities:

- Fund management / investments (e.g., endowments, trusts) on behalf of arts, culture, heritage organizations: 4 municipalities
- Modified planning regulations to support cultural sector (with no direct financial implications): 4 municipalities
- Line of credit / loan guarantees for arts, culture, and heritage organizations: 2 municipalities

A count of the number of indirect supports available in each municipality shows that, out of the 11 types of indirect supports:

- Brampton and London each provide ten indirect supports.
- Halifax and Mississauga provide nine supports.
- Edmonton, Sechelt, and Sudbury each provide seven indirect supports.
- Saskatoon provides six supports.

On average, the municipalities provide support in eight of the 11 areas. Saskatoon, with six indirect supports, is below this average. The five areas where the City has not provided indirect supports are:

- Free or below-market rates for arts, culture, and heritage organization advertising on city structures (e.g., bus shelters, buildings, etc.) (6 other municipalities do this)
- Formal arts, cultural or heritage districts (approval, development, or planning) (5 other municipalities do this)
- Fund management / investments (e.g., endowments, trusts) on behalf of arts, culture, and heritage organizations (4 other municipalities do this)
- Modified planning regulations to support cultural sector (with no direct financial implications) (4 other municipalities do this)
- Line of credit / loan guarantees for arts, culture, and heritage organizations (2 other municipalities do this)

### Comparison of the value of property tax rebates / abatements / exemptions

Because of the complexities associated with identifying all costs for each of the 11 supports, value estimates were partial in all eight participating municipalities. As such, an overall comparison of the value of indirect supports is not possible.

In the best cases, four or five municipalities provided full cost estimates of a specific indirect support. This is the case for one of the largest indirect support items: property tax rebates / abatements / exemptions. Because of its financial importance and the relatively large number of municipalities providing a full costing (5, plus one other that provided a partial costing), this is the one area where the municipal cost estimates (equalized to a per-capita assessment) are included in this comparison.

Saskatoon's per capita property tax abatements (\$1.16) are the lowest of the five municipalities that provided a full costing:

- Saskatoon: \$1.16
- Halifax: \$2.22
- Edmonton (2012 estimate): \$2.68
- Sechelt: \$3.51
- London: \$5.86 (including substantial 100% exemptions for two major cultural venues)

In addition, Greater Sudbury provided a partial estimate of its property tax reductions, which equal \$0.52 per capita.

Estimates of the value of property tax rebates were not available in Brampton and Mississauga.

## Appendix: Details of indirect municipal cultural investments in eight participating municipalities

Compiled by Kelly Hill, Hill Strategies Research, August 2017

### In-kind services for festivals, special events, film, etc. (e.g., permits, fire, police, EMS, waste management, transit, etc.)

- Brampton: In-kind support to 10 community cultural festivals and events through the Community Grant Program. Managed 224 film inquiries and issued 60 film permits, at no charge.
  - In theatre, the City piloted a co-production program with a local community theatre group.
- Edmonton: Festivals and events: Many in-kind services. Over 840 events annually (not all in culture or heritage). Only relatively low, incremental civic service costs are charged back to groups.
- Halifax: Not many in-kind services in support of festivals and events, which are responsible for costs of most municipal services.
  - HRM does provide a customizable parade float base free of charge which is used in approximately 30 events per year.
  - Permit fees are waived if there is no street closure involved in a parade. No quantity available.
  - The HRM Special Events Advisory Committee (SEAC) administers funding generated through the Marketing Levy Special Events Reserve, a levy on local hotels. SEAC and HRM Events staff provide expert review and feedback to events which are seeking funding, to improve the quality of applications and capacity for future application. No quantity available.
- London: 24 festivals and special events: In-kind contributions range from discounts on special event permits, property, music, lighting, sound equipment, film projectors, electrical, stanchions, chair, benches, bleachers, waste management, security, sponsorship, advertising, etc., as well as city staff time to setup event, run event, dismantle event, road closure costs.
- Mississauga: Limited: Recent compliance review and new policies have largely eliminated these types of support. Historically there were greater instances of in-kind support for festivals and events.
  - Film Office will waive road occupancy permit and location fees for student productions. Applied to 3 student productions in 2016 valued at \$1,270 in fees waived.
  - Small events in parks might not be charged for waste collection (Unable to apply \$ value or frequency)
  - Park permits are always issued so that use is tracked, but fees can be waived for groups with existing service agreements with the City if there is little impact (i.e. finish line set up for a boat race in a park, marathon, etc.) (Unable to apply \$ value or frequency)
  - No in-kind support from EMS (RofP), Police (RofP) or Fire (CofM)



- Saskatoon: 48 events were supported. Transit: road closures (barricades) and waste management (recycling and garbage receptacles); Parks: small turf repairs. EMO participated in 20 of these events but do not have a dollar estimate of their contribution.
- Sechelt: Special Events permits: 141 nfp rentals in 2016.
  - Municipal Parks & Public Works Crews: estimate of 1,040.5 hours. RCMP estimated costs only for major events with a dedicated officer.
  - Only included amounts for RCMP & municipal staff: municipality is not responsible for Fire, EMS or Transit.
- Sudbury: EMS: Paramedic Services had 4 events in 2016 where in-kind services were provided, excluding paid contracts or services under the User-Fee By-law.
  - Leisure Services Division: annual budget allocation primarily used to support overhead costs associated with special events and festivals (equipment delivery and supply, etc.)
  - Solid Waste: Formal programs include blue box recycling for special events and we have a blue box recycling program for non-profits/charitable organizations at no charge. In 2016, we had 36 Special Events. In 2016, there were 18 Non-profit Biz Box Participants.
  - Transit: Greater Sudbury Transit Fare & Transportation Grant provides financial support to not-for-profit organizations, with events or programs with transportation needs. Greater Sudbury Transit has been providing annual contributions towards the grant, which comes from a portion of its annual dedicated Provincial Gas Tax funds. Funds are disbursed based on approved, eligible application forms on a first-come, first-served basis.
  - Museums: Support to 4 festivals/events last year at the Anderson Farm, including free use of space, a grant and staff time (partial estimate of 70 hours).
  - Libraries: In addition to many events organized entirely in-house (e.g.: summer reading club, Graphic-Con, Makers' Space workshops, etc.), there were several partnerships where in-kind support was provided to 4 main outside groups, including free use of space and staff time (partial estimate of 62 hours). In 2017, the libraries are providing a book club subsidy (total of 20 people/session x 6-8 sessions planned in 2017), enabling the attendees to participate for free.
  - Tourism: Staff on-site surveying at festivals (approximately 8 events) x 3 hrs each max, SWAG, some internal transfers to support approximately 20 cultural events/year.

### Below-market or nominal rent in municipally-owned spaces for arts, culture, heritage organizations

- Brampton: 5 arts and culture organizations paid below-market value rent in 3 municipally-owned facilities
- Edmonton: 14 facilities / 28 organizations in 2016.
- Halifax: HRM facilitates access to lower cost municipal spaces via three mechanisms: 1) Reduced rental rates for not-for profits; 2) Less than market leases; 3) Less than market disposal of surplus properties. The types of groups receiving discounted rates are not tracked, and it is not known how often cultural organizations received discounted rental rates.

- London: Below market rent: City Arts Centre at Tblock City Facility.
- Mississauga: 6 arts, culture and heritage organizations pay nominal rent for City-owned space(s) and receive varying levels of additional in-kind support that might include IT, telephone, utilities, grounds maintenance, security, office furniture, equipment, reduced marketing and printing costs, etc. Some organizations pay what could be considered below market value for office space/storage or receive waived licensing fees to install displays such as walk of fames.
  - Affiliate groups are entitled to receive free meeting room space for monthly meetings and AGM. 38 arts, culture and heritage groups qualify.
  - Affiliate groups receive lower rental rates for booking room and facility rentals (15-20%) and park rentals (20-40%) over community groups.
  - The City has a specific reduced rate for artists to use Clarke Memorial Hall for rehearsal purposes.
  - Organizations who pay nominal rent (\$2) receive varying levels of additional in-kind support that might include IT, telephone, utilities, grounds maintenance, security, office furniture and equipment, etc. that is not assigned a dollar value. The City is moving towards service agreements with funded organizations that will properly capture in-kind services provided.
- Saskatoon: Only at TCU Place. Discounted rental rates for 17 different events (Saskatoon Symphony, dance organizations, choirs, etc.)
- Sechelt: Below-market venue rentals at Seaside Centre: 41 organizations paid 1/2 of commercial rate. Below-market leases at 3 locations: 3 orgs pay nominal rental fees of \$1 or \$10 each.
- Sudbury: Leisure: 8 organizations identified as using municipally owned spaces in Leisure facilities at reduced or nominal rates (there may be others): Northern Ontario Film Studios (former Barrydowne Arena); Myths & Mirrors Community Arts (Victory Playground field house); Sudbury Basin Potters (Lansing Playground field house); Valley East Community Theatre (Capreol Millennium Centre classroom); Onaping Falls Art Club (Onaping Community Centre classroom); Sudbury Rock & Lapidary Society (Naughton Community Centre room); Rayside Balfour Whitewater Brush & Palette Club (occasional use of Whitewater Park); Rayside Balfour Stitchery Club (use of the Chelmsford Community Centre / Arena hall)
  - Also Older Adults Centre, Café-musique, Sudbury Art Club, possibly others
  - Libraries/Museums: Policy provincially mandates free use for not-for-profit organizations (hundreds of groups access this every year). Walden Seniors and Pensioners Woodworkers use space at Anderson Farm for free, with some carpentry work provided to the Museums. The Northern Ontario Railroad Museum & Heritage Centre occupies 3 municipal facilities for free (fire station, boarding in Millennium Centre and stationmaster's house) and also receives an annual grant for facility upkeep.
  - Economic Development: Northern Ontario Film Studios, Northern Water Sports Centre (rental profits go towards NWSC, proceeds split between the City and tenant clubs).

## Property tax rebates / abatements / exemptions for arts, culture, heritage organizations (whether through local decision-making or provincial statutes)

- Brampton: Yes, 40% rebate for cultural charities that occupy commercial or industrial property. No estimate of number or value.
- Edmonton: Property tax rebates for not-for-profit organizations that own their facilities
- Halifax: Numerous cultural organizations receive different levels of tax relief, up to full (100%) relief.
- London: Property tax rebates: Registered Charities who lease space in commercial buildings are eligible for a 40% rebate of the property taxes they paid. The City receives around 100 applications per year. Full exemption for two arts and culture venues: Budweiser Gardens and the Grand Theatre.
- Mississauga: There are organizations that as tenants within municipally owned facilities are not currently subject to property tax, the value of which has not been calculated.
- Saskatoon: Only arts/culture/heritage organizations in the Culture Grant Program are eligible for a tax abatement. 6 organizations (6 properties) received abatements.
- Sechelt: 2 organizations receive 100% property tax exemption
- Sudbury: Tax relief identified for Theatre Cambrian and Sudbury Theatre Centre but not the Art Gallery of Sudbury.
  - Planning department has tax rebate programs in designated areas (downtown and town centres) that could sometimes be applied to cultural organizations. No estimate of number or value.

## Line of credit / loan guarantees for arts, culture, heritage organizations

- Brampton: No
- Edmonton: No
- Halifax: No
- London: One line of credit and one loan guarantee.
- Mississauga: The arts centre has an operating line of credit with the City that is available to meet temporary cash flow requirements. The line of credit was not accessed in 2016. There have been instances prior to 2016 where arts organizations have received interest free loans.
- Saskatoon: No
- Sechelt: No
- Sudbury: No

## Fund management / investments (e.g., endowments, trusts) on behalf of arts, culture, heritage organizations

- Brampton: Management of a reserve fund on behalf of the Local Architectural Conservation Committee. Management of a theatre capital improvement fund and a heritage initiatives fund.

- Edmonton: Yes, but minimal: Funds in a trust from the 83 Universiad Games for occasional sports or culture projects (application process / grant).
- Halifax: No
- London: Currently one: London Endowment Fund for Heritage, administered by the London Community Foundation but London Advisory Committee on Heritage adjudicates the interest.
- Mississauga: No
- Saskatoon: No
- Sechelt: No
- Sudbury: City received a grant from the Sudbury Community Foundation on behalf of We Live Up Here (because the organization is not a registered charity).

### Community capacity building (e.g., board development, organizational development, workshops, seminars, meetings)

- Brampton: Brampton's Entrepreneur Centre (BEC) assists cultural entrepreneurs develop new or existing businesses (idea validation, business plan preparation, cost breakdowns and analysis). Also seminars and workshops specifically for cultural entrepreneurs.
- Edmonton: Provided by the Edmonton Arts Council on an ad-hoc basis. For example, financial literacy courses for non-profits at minimal costs (\$100) for participants. About 20 organizations participated in 2016.
- Halifax: Grants and Contributions staff regularly advise and assist community groups to increase their capacity to navigate and apply to the Community Grants program. This service was offered to 30+ organizations in 2016/17.
  - Most of the 25 HRM owned and operated community centres provide some form of in-kind support for cultural organizations, sometimes involving capacity building activities such as staff participation on boards and support for board development.
- London: The Culture Office, London Arts Council and the London Heritage Council provide a lot of workshops, seminars and meetings in kind to the arts and heritage community. Space rental, food and staff time for these workshops are in-kind expenses.
- Mississauga: Community Development staff in Culture, Parks & Forestry and Recreation Divisions provide support to organizations and festival and event organizers.
  - In 2016 the City provided funding support to the art gallery to undertake an expansion feasibility study.
  - Liaison support to 42 Affiliate arts, culture and heritage organizations.
  - In previous years, the Culture Division offered a series of capacity building workshops for grant recipients around governance, strategic plan development, fundraising and marketing.
  - In 2017 and beyond, a small dedicated budget for cultural capacity building has been allocated.
- Saskatoon: Meet and greet/networking; Anti-racism workshop; CDM board workshop; public art workshop.
- Sechelt: Not in 2016, but have done occasionally. Sometimes hosted by an external group (contracted by the municipality), sometimes provided by municipal staff.

- Sudbury: Many supports through Economic Development, Community Development, Business Centre, and other departments.
  - Economic Development: Permit-Palooza open house for event organizers in 2017, site plan control meeting and staff assistance with Place des arts, ArtsBuild Ontario workshop series, Work in Culture series, film panel series, Cultural Forum, 5 info sessions as part of Arts & Culture Grant Program, tourism marketing partnership meetings on monthly basis, Tourism Forum, 40% of tourism partners are "cultural" out of 60.
  - Community Development: City supports 15 Community Action Networks with a small admin grant each, monthly meetings in City buildings (1.5-3 hrs each; half of them use this), staff attend every second meeting from September to June, and an Annual Summit (4 hrs) coordinated by staff. Staff also assists their visioning sessions which occur every 3 years.
  - Regional Business Centre: Win this Space (2017), BizSmarts (2017)
  - Growth & Infrastructure: Flour Mill CIP (2017) and Myths & Mirrors consults on ad hoc basis for public art projects.
  - Large Projects: money earmarked in 2016 towards a business plan/feasibility study for a shared facility between the Art Gallery of Sudbury and Main Branch Library. Commitment approved for Place des arts as well as transfer of land. Funds allocated to the RFP process for the new arena/entertainment centre. Staff time provided to advance the Synergy Centre (multipurpose/convention centre).
  - Museums: board development and facilitation of strategic plan provided to Anderson Farm Museum Heritage Society (5-10 hrs estimate).

### Free or below-market rates for arts, culture, heritage organization advertising on city structures (e.g., bus shelters, buildings, etc.)

- Brampton: No-charge services: Approved posters and other promotional messages in municipal recreation centres and information boards. Screen advertising opportunities for grant recipients.
  - Promotion of co-productions with community groups in the Rose Theatre season brochure. Online event calendars.
- Edmonton: No
- Halifax: Corporate Communications offers support to not-for-profit cultural organizations in the form of social media advertising, inclusion on HRM webpage in events listings, etc.
- London: Not-for-profit rates for bus shelters and bus advertising.
- Mississauga: The City has outdoor digital marquee signs that promote upcoming events. Organizations are allowed to market their events free of charge on these signs.
  - Organizations are promoted free of charge through the City's tourism website and printed visitor guides.
  - Select major festivals are entitled to subsidized mobile road signs.
- Saskatoon: No

- Sechelt: Free advertising for not-for-profits on Community Event Banners and in Summer Events Listing (for tourists). Staff time and materials foregone.
- Sudbury: Not-for-profit rate to advertise on LED board in Bell Park, advertising fence panels at James Jerome Sports Complex, marquees at TM Davies and Centennial Arenas.
  - Advertising on Transit buses, bus shelters and community arena rink boards is contracted out to a third party.
  - Free use of approximately 10 poster boards across library branches and 4 LED message boards for not-for-profit organizations (specific criteria in place). Sudbury Arts Council curates and organizes logistics for art displays at the library (space only, provided for free).
  - Not-for-profit organizations can have tourism partner a la carte rates subsidized by providing in-kind stuff, e.g.: brochure rack, web banner listings, ad buy-ins, visitor guide listings, etc. in exchange for hosting space, tickets for give-aways, summer digital campaign on festivals, social media ads after \$150 base membership, etc. Free event calendar listings for everyone, relevant cultural offerings are covered in blog.
  - 2016 Provincial Planning Workshop in Sudbury: Planning Services Division delivered a presentation on Public Art, followed by a tour of Downtown Sudbury.

### Formal arts, cultural, or heritage districts (approval, development, or planning)

- Brampton: One formal heritage district (Churchville Heritage Conservation District) and one in development (Main Street South, downtown)
- Edmonton: Yes, but minimal: The Arts District is not associated with any financial outcomes. Also: work with community-driven committee to determine if the City could be doing more to promote that area of downtown.
- Halifax: The Halifax Regional Municipality currently has one Heritage Conservation District in place, the Barrington Street Heritage Conservation District, which is valued for its character and evolution as Halifax's principal downtown commercial street. In addition to Barrington Street, the municipality has formally initiated a process to designate two more areas as heritage conservation districts: the Old South Suburb and Schmitville. HRM will likely consider arts and cultural districts and other cultural landscapes through the Culture and Heritage Priorities Plan (2017-2019).
- London: Seven Heritage Conservation Districts designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act: East Woodfield HCD (1993), Bishop Hellmuth HCD (2003), Old East HCD (2006), West Woodfield HCD (2008), Downtown HCD (2013), Blackfriars/Petersville HCD (2015), Wortley Village-Old South HCD (2015).
  - Municipal Council has directed the preparation of two additional Heritage Conservation District Plans: Great Talbot and Gibbons Park. There is a roster of potential Heritage Conservation Districts recommended for study and evaluation.
  - The Music, Entertainment and Culture Districts Feasibility Study Report may lead to a new district. Representatives from Planning, the Culture Office, the Arts Council, Parks and Recreation, By-law Enforcement, Downtown London and Old East Village spent a considerable amount of time working on the study.

- Mississauga: On-street restaurant patios are permitted in the Port Credit Culture Node. The City waives encroachment application fees and legal fees valued at \$1,695 in 2016. The value of on-street parking fee losses is not captured.
  - Heritage District studies were undertaken in 2015 and 2017/18.
- Saskatoon: No
- Sechelt: Not formal districts, but Official Community Plan recommends "Downtown First" (not a requirement or official district). Retain Downtown as the centre of cultural activities, including public art, theatres, art galleries, festivals and artists' studios. Aim to integrate arts and cultural uses in existing and new community facilities and public open space.
- Sudbury: No

### Heritage conservation incentives (indirect / non-monetary)

- Brampton: Free heritage conservation tools, resources and assistance, an ongoing plaque program for owners of cultural heritage resources, and awards of merit for well-maintained cultural heritage resources. Also an interpretive sign program for heritage conservation.
- Edmonton: No
- Halifax: Building permit fees are waived for properties within a Heritage Conservation District. Other development fees or associated fees such as Halifax Water charges still apply.
- London: Heritage Community Improvement Plan has two programs: tax increment grants and development charges equivalent grant. The by-law enabling a Heritage Property Tax Relief Program is in force, but the program has not received funding beyond 2007-2009 program.
  - Downtown Community Improvement Plan has a facade improvement loan program and tax grant program.
  - Old East Community Improvement Plan and SoHo Community Improvement Plan had loan and grant programs but are not within a Heritage Conservation District.
- Mississauga: No
- Saskatoon: Support for mural project that may include alternative solutions to address building code requirements, providing streetscaping elements which enhance the heritage structure, or a rezoning by agreement for adaptive reuse of the property.
- Sechelt: In District's Official Community Plan: "The use of innovative measures to preserve privately owned buildings with heritage value will be considered, including Heritage Revitalization Agreements, density bonus or other incentives."
  - Heritage inventory will be developed
  - Bylaw process for designation as a Municipal heritage site or a Heritage Conservation Area
  - Support private owners to protect buildings, sites and landscapes with heritage value
  - Support for adaptive reuse of older buildings
  - "Development Permit Area guidelines will be used to support preservation of buildings or building facades in order to protect heritage values and enhance community uniqueness and identity."
  - District will work with and seek funding from senior governments and community organizations to assist with identifying and protecting heritage resources.
- Sudbury: No

## Modified planning regulations to support cultural sector (with no direct financial implications)

- Brampton: Yes, through Heritage Building Protection Plan, Vacant Building By-Law, Minimum Standards of Maintenance, Official Plan, and Secondary Plan Policies.
- Edmonton: No
- Halifax: Policy 6.8 of Halifax Municipal Planning Strategy, and a handful of identical policies in other plan areas, allow for an expanded set of uses in registered heritage buildings: “In any building, part of a building, or on any lot on which a registered heritage building is situated, the owner may apply to the City for a development agreement for any development or change in use not otherwise permitted by the land use designation and zone subject to [some minor considerations related to keeping its heritage integrity].”
  - HRM staff have identified 9 examples of when policy 6.8 (or similar) has been used in recent years. In most cases, provisions were written into “Heritage Development Agreements” to permit the specific use not otherwise permitted in the zone.
  - Policy D-1 (h) of the Downtown Dartmouth Secondary Municipal Planning Strategy encourages good urban design through the provision of "public art [...] on or adjacent to buildings" upon development or renovation within the downtown area. This policy has been used to approve a number of developments in Dartmouth. A major development was approved in 2016/2017 which requires public art valued at 1% of the construction costs, an estimated \$400,000 value.
- London: Not currently, but possibly in the future. The Music, Entertainment and Culture District Study may eventually require changes to the Special Events Policies and Procedures Manual (Parks and Recreation), Zoning By-law (Planning), Noise By-law (By-law Enforcement) and other by-laws.
- Mississauga: In 2016, the City launched a Busking Program which required a by-law exemption. Busking permits are issued to a select number of artists who apply. The artists are limited to performing in select parks throughout the City which are identified by “busking stops”.
  - Future plans through 2018 Culture Master Plan: develop cultural districts with the possibility of Official Plan and zoning amendments to better support the cultural sector
- Saskatoon: No
- Sechelt: No
- Sudbury: Northern Ontario Film Studios leases a former municipal arena to operate a studio and equipment rental hub for film. It is situated on municipal property within a residential neighbourhood under a temporary re-zoning.



## Density bonusing (i.e., allowing higher building density in return for community benefits)

- Brampton: Development Permit System for Main Street North: City may consider the exchange of height and/or density for the provisions of facilities, services and other matters, including cultural and heritage resources.
- Edmonton: No
- Halifax: Policy 18 of the Downtown Halifax Municipal Planning Strategy, as enabled by the HRM Charter provision 245A, allows for the consideration of additional density (pre and post bonus heights) in exchange for a public benefit including one or a combination of the following cultural benefits: a) where the development includes a registered heritage property which is to be maintained, the preservation or enhancement of the heritage resource; b) the provision of rental commercial space made available at a subsidized cost for arts; and/or c) the provision of public art.
- London: Section 4.3 of Zoning By-law Z-1 provides for bonusing for residential and/or commercial heritage buildings which are designated up to 25% on the basis of the gross floor area retained and designated or through a reduction in the parking requirement or increase in the number of residential units allowed. The City has started bonusing but does not have statistics available.
- Mississauga: The City supports select public art and cultural infrastructure projects through density bonusing in select areas of the city, as per Section 37 of the Ontario Planning Act. There were no public art projects funded via Section 37 in 2016, but money was allocated towards an arts and culture facility during the year.
- Saskatoon: Yes, but not recently. Density bonus allowed in Downtown Commercial Zoning District (public plazas, public art, conservation and incorporation of significant existing heritage or historical feature).
- Sechelt: Up to 10% density bonus for providing cultural or recreational facilities. Most recent cultural example was 2012/13 (i.e., none in 2016).
- Sudbury: No